

**NOTES ON HISTORICAL EVIDENCE
IN REFERENCE TO ADVERSE
THEORIES OF THE ORIGIN AND
NATURE OF THE GOVERNMENT OF
THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA**

Published @ 2017 Trieste Publishing Pty Ltd

ISBN 9780649511495

Notes on Historical Evidence in Reference to Adverse Theories of the Origin and Nature of the Government of the United States of America by John B. Dillon

Except for use in any review, the reproduction or utilisation of this work in whole or in part in any form by any electronic, mechanical or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including xerography, photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, is forbidden without the permission of the publisher, Trieste Publishing Pty Ltd, PO Box 1576 Collingwood, Victoria 3066 Australia.

All rights reserved.

Edited by Trieste Publishing Pty Ltd.
Cover @ 2017

This book is sold subject to the condition that it shall not, by way of trade or otherwise, be lent, re-sold, hired out, or otherwise circulated without the publisher's prior consent in any form or binding or cover other than that in which it is published and without a similar condition including this condition being imposed on the subsequent purchaser.

www.triestepublishing.com

JOHN B. DILLON

**NOTES ON HISTORICAL EVIDENCE
IN REFERENCE TO ADVERSE
THEORIES OF THE ORIGIN AND
NATURE OF THE GOVERNMENT OF
THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA**

NOTES
ON
HISTORICAL EVIDENCE
IN REFERENCE TO
ADVERSE THEORIES
OF THE
ORIGIN AND NATURE
OF THE
GOVERNMENT OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA.

BY
JOHN B. DILLON,
AUTHOR OF A HISTORY OF INDIANA.

"Contemporanea expeditio est optima et fortissima in lege."
A contemporaneous exposition is the best and strongest in law.
Wharton's Legal Maxims.

NEW YORK:
PRINTED BY S. W. GREEN,
No. 18 JACOB STREET.
1871.

PREFATORY NOTE.

MANY good reasons have induced me to believe that a fair consideration of the historical facts which have been compiled from various authentic sources, and embodied in the following Notes, will help, in no small degree—

First, To weaken the power of certain political errors, which, from the beginning of the Government of the United States to the present time, have constantly exercised a disturbing influence on the administration of the National Affairs. And,

Secondly, To promote the growth, and the perpetuity, of sound and harmonious opinions on important questions which relate to the Origin and Nature of the Government of the United States, to the Constitutional powers of Congress, and to the reserved Rights of the several States of the Union.

J. B. D.

NEW YORK, November, 1871.

CONTENTS.

CHAPTER I.

	PAGE
John Adams on Party Divisions.....	11
John Adams on Lost History.....	11
Disputes on Nature of Government.....	12
Theory of Sovereignty of the People.....	12
Theory of State Sovereignty.....	13
Views in favor of State Sovereignty.....	13
Sovereignty "Retained".....	14
Congress, in 1777, on Articles of Confederation.....	14
Congress, in 1779, on the Internal Policy of a State.....	14
Luther Martin on State Sovereignty, and James Madison on Luther Martin.....	15, 16
Justice Samuel Chase on State Sovereignty.....	16
Virginia Resolutions of 1798.....	16
Views of Virginia House of Delegates in 1799-1800.....	17
Kentucky Resolutions of 1799.....	17
Tucker's Blackstone on State Sovereignty.....	18
John Taylor, of Virginia, on State Sovereignty.....	19
Robert Y. Hayne, of South Carolina, on State Sovereignty and Powers of Congress.....	20
John C. Calhoun on State Sovereignty.....	22
John C. Calhoun on Powers of the General Government.....	23
South Carolina Convention of 1832, on State Sovereignty.....	23
Nashville Convention of 1850, on the Right of Secession.....	23
National Democratic Convention of 1850, on Kentucky and Virginia Resolutions.....	24
National Whig Convention of 1850, on the Nature of the Government of the United States.....	24
Daniel Webster on State Sovereignty.....	24
William H. Seward on State Sovereignty.....	25
Chief Justice Taney on State Sovereignty and the Nature of the Government of the United States.....	25
Justice Catron on State Sovereignty.....	26
James Buchanan on Grants of Specific Powers by the States.....	26
Jefferson Davis on State Sovereignty.....	26
Sharswood's Blackstone on State Sovereignty.....	27

	PAGE
New American Cyclopædia on Powers not Expressly Granted to the Federal Government.....	27
Geographical Dictionary on Powers not Expressly Conceded to the General Government.....	27
Justice Clifford on State Sovereignty.....	28
Chief Justice Chase on State Sovereignty.....	28
Edward Everett on Sovereign Republics.....	28

CHAPTER II.

Influence of Authorities.....	29
Contradictory Theories.....	30
Relating to Evidence.....	30
Contemporaneous Construction.....	30
Rules of Construction.....	31

CHAPTER III.

Definitions.....	33
Grotius on Sovereignty.....	33
Blackstone on Sovereignty.....	34
Bouvier on Sovereignty.....	34
Political Sovereignty.....	34
Story on Sovereignty.....	35
Justice Blair on Sovereignty, and the word "Retain".....	35
Nathan Dane on Sovereignty.....	36
Austin on Sovereignty.....	36
M. D'Alembert on the Sovereign Power in a Republic.....	37
James Madison on Sovereignty.....	37
Lewis Cass on Sovereignty in the United States.....	37

CHAPTER IV.

Of Nations and States. Noah Webster's definition of a Nation.....	39
Encyclopædia Britannica on the word Nation.....	39
Phillimore on a State.....	39
Judge Story on a Sovereign State.....	40
Wheaton on Independent States.....	40
James Madison on the term <i>States</i>	40
New American Cyclopædia on the Sovereignty of a State.....	41
Montesquieu on Sovereign States, and Crab on the term <i>States</i>	41
The <i>State</i> of Great Britain.....	42
San Marino, a State.....	42
Tobasco, a State.....	42
Austin on Confederate States.....	42
Mr. Pendleton, of Virginia, in 1788, on the phrase "We, the People".....	42
Mr. Corbin, of Virginia, in 1788, on "We, the People".....	43
Mr. Wilson, of Pennsylvania, in 1788, on "We, the People of the United States".....	43

CONTENTS.

vii

	PAGE
James Madison on "We, the People".....	44
Mr. Nicholas, of Virginia, in 1789, on "We, the People".....	44
Bayard on "the People of the United States".....	45

CHAPTER V.

Virginia House of Burgesses, in 1774.....	46
General Congress proposed, in 1774.....	46
Massachusetts House of Representatives, in 1774.....	47
Meeting of Continental Congress, in 1774.....	47
Object of the Revolutionary Movement.....	47
On Voting in Congress, in 1774.....	48
Association formed in Congress, 1774.....	48
Resolution adopted by Officers of Dunmore's Expedition, in 1774.....	48
Resolution adopted by Inhabitants of Westmoreland County, Pennsylvania, in 1775.....	49
Mechlenburg Declaration, in 1775.....	49
"Defense of American Liberty".....	50
"The Defense of America".....	50
The Union, in 1775.....	50
Address to the People of Ireland, in 1775.....	51
On Colonial Petitions, in 1775.....	51
"The Cause of American Liberty," in 1775.....	52
Exports from certain Colonies, permitted by Congress, in 1775.....	52
America "has a blank sheet to write upon," in 1775.....	53
Sermon at Philadelphia, in 1775.....	53
Whigs and Tories, in 1775.....	53
Provincial Congress, at Watertown, in 1775.....	54
Thomas Jefferson's Views, in 1775.....	54
James Wilson, of Pennsylvania, on the Declaration of Independence... ..	55
Views of the Colonists at the beginning of the Revolution.....	55
Germans, in 1775.....	56

CHAPTER VI.

Congress recommends the Adoption of State Governments.....	57
Delegates in Congress from Virginia instructed to propose Declaration of Independence.....	58
Virginia Bill of Rights, in 1776.....	58
Declaration of Independence.....	59
Declaration to be Proclaimed in each of the United States.....	59
New York Convention, in 1776.....	60
Resolution of Congress, in 1776.....	60
Resolution of Congress, in 1776.....	60
Resolution of Congress, in 1776.....	61
Resolution of Congress, in 1776.....	61
John Hancock's Views, in 1776.....	61
Battalions to be Enlisted, in 1776.....	63
Population of the Union, in 1775.....	63

	PAGE
Instructions to Commissioners, in 1776.....	63
United Colonies changed to United States, in 1776.....	64
America to be "great among the Nations of the Earth".....	64
United States "free and independent," in 1776.....	64

CHAPTER VII.

Articles of Confederation proposed.....	65
Mr. Wilson, of Pennsylvania, on Confederation.....	65
John Adams on Confederation.....	66
Congress on Confederation, in 1777.....	66
"Address of Congress to the Inhabitants of the United States of America," in 1778.....	67
Treaty of 1778.....	67
Treaty of 1778.....	67
<i>Maryland Gazette</i> , in 1778.....	68
<i>New York Journal</i> , in 1778.....	68
<i>New Jersey Gazette</i> , in 1779.....	68
King of France, in 1780.....	68
Anthony Wayne and other officers, in 1780.....	69
Proclamation by Congress, in 1781.....	69
John Adams, in 1781.....	69
<i>Pennsylvania Journal</i> , in 1782.....	69
House of Delegates of Virginia, in 1782.....	70
Congress, in 1783.....	70
Secretary of Foreign Affairs, in 1783.....	70
Congress, in 1783.....	71
Treaty of 1783.....	71
Treaty of 1785.....	71
Lord Sheffield, in 1783.....	72
The Sardinian Minister, in 1783.....	72
Congress, in 1783.....	73
Oration at Boston, in 1783.....	73
Washington, in 1783.....	73
Dr. Witherspoon's Opinion.....	74
<i>Pennsylvania Journal</i> , of 1783.....	74
Washington, in 1783.....	74

CHAPTER VIII.

Proclamation by Congress, in 1784.....	75
Thomas Jefferson's Views, in 1785.....	76
Congress, in 1785.....	76
Thomas Jefferson, in 1788.....	76
General Assembly of Virginia, in 1786.....	78
Congress, in 1786.....	78
Noah Webster, in 1786.....	79
Thomas Jefferson on Coercing States.....	80
Thomas Jefferson on the Confederation.....	80
Resolution of Congress, in 1787.....	80

CHAPTER IX.

	PAGE
Resolution of Congress, in 1787.....	61
Theory of State Sovereignty, in the Convention of 1787.....	81
National Government and State Governments.....	82
Opinions of Mr. Wilson, of Pennsylvania, in 1787.....	82
Opinions of Charles Pinckney, of South Carolina, in 1787.....	83
Opinions of James Madison, in 1787.....	83
Opinions of Alexander Hamilton, in 1787.....	84
Views of Washington, in 1787.....	84
Opinion of Luther Martin, in 1788.....	85
Views of Dr. Benjamin Rush, in 1787.....	85
Popular Opinion at Philadelphia, in 1788.....	86
Opinion of James Madison, in 1788.....	86
Opinion of John Marshall, in 1788.....	87
Opinion of Mr. Corbin, of Virginia, in 1788.....	87
Opinion of Mr. Wilson, of Pennsylvania, in 1788.....	87
Opinion of Mr. Inula, of Virginia, in 1788.....	87
Opinions of Rawlins Lowndes and of Charles Cotesworth Pinckney, in 1788.....	88
Opinion of George Bancroft.....	89
Opinion of Governor Randolph, of Virginia, in 1788.....	90
Opinions of Henry Lee, of Virginia, in 1788.....	90

CHAPTER X.

Opinions of Mr. Page, of Virginia, in 1789.....	91
Opinions of James Madison, in 1789.....	91
Vote in 1789, on Restricting Congress to the Exercise of Powers "ex- pressly" granted.....	92
Erroneous use of the word "Expressly".....	93
Views of Chief Justice Jay, in 1793.....	93
Views of Justice Paterson, in 1795.....	94
Passages in Washington's Farewell Address.....	94
John Adams, in 1799.....	95
Views of Chief Justice Marshall, in 1819.....	95
Views of Andrew Jackson, in 1832.....	95
Opinions of Joseph Story.....	96
Views of Daniel Webster.....	97
Opinion of John C. Calhoun.....	97
Views of William H. Seward.....	98
Opinion of John Quincy Adams.....	98
Views of Chief Justice Chase.....	98
James Madison, on certain Political Errors.....	99
James Madison, on "a fundamental error".....	99
Views of the Supreme Court of the United States.....	100