

STATE TAXATION OF PERSONAL INCOMES

Published @ 2017 Trieste Publishing Pty Ltd

ISBN 9780649282494

State taxation of personal incomes by Alzada Comstock

Except for use in any review, the reproduction or utilisation of this work in whole or in part in any form by any electronic, mechanical or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including xerography, photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, is forbidden without the permission of the publisher, Trieste Publishing Pty Ltd, PO Box 1576 Collingwood, Victoria 3066 Australia.

All rights reserved.

Edited by Trieste Publishing Pty Ltd.
Cover @ 2017

This book is sold subject to the condition that it shall not, by way of trade or otherwise, be lent, re-sold, hired out, or otherwise circulated without the publisher's prior consent in any form or binding or cover other than that in which it is published and without a similar condition including this condition being imposed on the subsequent purchaser.

www.triestepublishing.com

ALZADA COMSTOCK

**STATE TAXATION
OF PERSONAL
INCOMES**

STATE TAXATION OF PERSONAL
INCOMES

BY
ALZADA COMSTOCK, A. M.
Associate Professor of Economics
Mount Holyoke College

SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS
FOR THE DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY
IN THE
FACULTY OF POLITICAL SCIENCE
COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY

NEW YORK
1921

AMERICA

HJ 4653

56 C5

REPRODUCTION

PREFACE

BELIEVING that the fiscal aspects of state income taxes were in danger of being overlooked in the enthusiasm for progressive income taxation, the writer made a brief study of the yield and cost of these taxes early in 1920. The paper appeared as "Fiscal Aspects of State Income Taxes" in the *American Economic Review* for June, 1920. In the present study an attempt has been made to present more fully the facts which represent the financial standing of these taxes, together with a description of their background and of the manner in which they operate.

The writer wishes to acknowledge indebtedness to Mr. A. E. Holcomb of the National Tax Association for helpful suggestions and for permission to reprint the material in the appendices, to Mr. Nils P. Haugen, formerly chairman of the Wisconsin Tax Commission and to other state officials who have generously supplied information which was not available in published reports, and especially to Professor Edwin R. A. Seligman of Columbia University, under whose direction the study was carried on and whose constructive criticism made its accomplishment possible.

ALZADA COMSTOCK

MOUNT HOLYOKE COLLEGE, JUNE 20, 1921.

C

401977

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | PAGE |
|--|------|
| CHAPTER I | |
| THE EVOLUTION OF THE STATE INCOME TAX | |
| 1. Early faculty taxes | 12 |
| 2. State income taxes in the nineteenth century | 14 |
| 3. Recent income tax legislation | 16 |
| 4. The changed attitude towards the tax | 18 |
| 5. The development of model income tax laws | 26 |
| CHAPTER II | |
| THE WISCONSIN INCOME TAX | |
| 1. History of the legislation | 34 |
| 2. The financial history of the tax | 45 |
| 3. The outlook for the income tax in Wisconsin | 50 |
| CHAPTER III | |
| THE TAXATION OF INCOMES IN MISSISSIPPI AND OKLAHOMA | |
| 1. The present Mississippi tax | 58 |
| 2. Efforts to reform the Mississippi law | 59 |
| 3. The history of the Oklahoma tax | 62 |
| CHAPTER IV | |
| THE MASSACHUSETTS INCOME TAX | |
| 1. The earlier taxation of incomes | 67 |
| 2. Financial results in Massachusetts | 77 |
| 3. The success of the income tax | 79 |
| 4. Present income tax problems in Massachusetts | 83 |
| CHAPTER V | |
| INCOME TAXES IN MISSOURI AND DELAWARE | |
| 1. The Missouri income tax | 86 |
| 2. The Delaware income tax | 89 |

CHAPTER VI

INCOME TAXES IN VIRGINIA, SOUTH CAROLINA, AND NORTH CAROLINA

1. History of the Virginia income tax 93
2. The yield of the tax in Virginia 94
3. The repeal of the South Carolina income tax law 96
4. The taxation of incomes in North Carolina 100

CHAPTER VII

THE NEW YORK INCOME TAX

1. The history of the movement 104
2. The present income tax law 111
3. The revenue from the tax 124
4. Unsettled questions 127

CHAPTER VIII

THE NORTH DAKOTA INCOME TAX

1. The income tax law of 1919 136
2. Criticisms of the law of 1919 138
3. The operation of the income tax law 142
4. The future of the income tax in North Dakota 145

CHAPTER IX

THE INCOME TAX MOVEMENT IN NEW MEXICO AND ALABAMA

1. The New Mexico income tax 149
2. The attempt to introduce an income tax in Alabama 153

CHAPTER X

THE INCOME TAX MOVEMENT IN OTHER STATES

1. Proposals for an income tax in Ohio 156
2. The income tax movement in Georgia 160
3. The income tax movement in California 162
4. Other steps towards income taxes 163

CHAPTER XI

MODERN INCOME TAX METHODS AND RESULTS

1. Income tax rates 167
2. Exemptions and deductions 171
3. Double taxation 184
4. The new type of administration 190
5. Assessment, collection, and review 193

| | PAGE |
|---|------|
| 6. An assessment roll for the income tax | 196 |
| 7. Collection and information at the source | 197 |
| 8. The distribution of the proceeds of the income tax | 201 |
| 9. Financial results | 205 |
| 10. Conclusion | 206 |

APPENDIX I

| | |
|--|-----|
| PRELIMINARY REPORT OF THE COMMITTEE ON A MODEL SYSTEM OF STATE AND LOCAL TAXATION | 208 |
|--|-----|

APPENDIX II

| | |
|--|-----|
| DRAFT OF A MODEL PERSONAL INCOME TAX LAW | 218 |
| BIBLIOGRAPHY | 241 |
| INDEX | 244 |