

**CLASSICAL ASSOCIATION  
OF SCOTLAND.  
PROCEEDINGS 1904-5**

Published @ 2017 Trieste Publishing Pty Ltd

ISBN 9780649499458

Classical Association of Scotland. Proceedings 1904-5 by Various

Except for use in any review, the reproduction or utilisation of this work in whole or in part in any form by any electronic, mechanical or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including xerography, photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, is forbidden without the permission of the publisher, Trieste Publishing Pty Ltd, PO Box 1576 Collingwood, Victoria 3066 Australia.

All rights reserved.

Edited by Trieste Publishing Pty Ltd.  
Cover @ 2017

This book is sold subject to the condition that it shall not, by way of trade or otherwise, be lent, re-sold, hired out, or otherwise circulated without the publisher's prior consent in any form or binding or cover other than that in which it is published and without a similar condition including this condition being imposed on the subsequent purchaser.

[www.triestepublishing.com](http://www.triestepublishing.com)

**VARIOUS**

**CLASSICAL ASSOCIATION  
OF SCOTLAND.  
PROCEEDINGS 1904-5**



CLASSICAL ASSOCIATION  
OF SCOTLAND

CLASSICAL ASSOCIATION  
OF SCOTLAND

---

PROCEEDINGS 1904-5

---

EDINBURGH  
H & J. PILLANS & WILSON, 86 HANOVER STREET

1905



## Contents and Index to Speakers.

MEETING HELD AT EDINBURGH, 29th NOVEMBER 1904.

	Page
PRIVATE BUSINESS . . . . .	1
PRESIDENT'S OPENING ADDRESS . . . . .	2
THE PRONUNCIATION OF GREEK AND LATIN IN SCHOOLS AND COLLEGES, by Professor Hardie, Edinburgh . . . . .	9
Remarks by the President . . . . .	23, 27
" Professor Harrower . . . . .	24
" Professor Burnet . . . . .	25, 27
" Mr Maybin . . . . .	25
" Mr Carter . . . . .	26
" Mr M'Petrie . . . . .	26
" Mr Buckland Green . . . . .	27
" Dr Patrick . . . . .	27
" Mr Logan . . . . .	27
" Miss Ainslie . . . . .	28
" Professor Butcher . . . . .	28
" Professor Hardie . . . . .	30
THE LITERARY TEACHING OF ANCIENT AND MODERN LANGUAGES, by Professor Saintsbury, Edinburgh . . . . .	31
Remarks by Professor Mair . . . . .	42
" Professor Harrower . . . . .	42
" Professor Wight Duff . . . . .	42
" Mr George Smith . . . . .	43
" Professor Butcher . . . . .	43
" the President . . . . .	45

## MEETING HELD AT ABERDEEN, 11th MARCH 1905.

	Page
PRIVATE BUSINESS . . . . .	47
PRESIDENT'S OPENING ADDRESS . . . . .	48
SOME READINGS AND RENDERINGS IN THE ODYSSEY OF HORACE, by John Marshall, M.A., LL.D., Rector of the Royal High School, Edinburgh . . . . .	58
Remarks by Professor Mair . . . . .	78
" Professor Burnet . . . . .	79
" Mr Logan . . . . .	80
" the President . . . . .	81
" Dr Marshall . . . . .	81
SUGGESTIONS AS TO THE TEACHING OF GREEK, by Professor A. W. Mair, Edinburgh . . . . .	82
Remarks by the President . . . . .	100
" Professor Harrower . . . . .	101
" Mr Morland Simpson . . . . .	101
" Mr Kiddoch . . . . .	102
" Professor Burnet . . . . .	102
" Mr Milne . . . . .	103
" Dr Ogilvie . . . . .	103
" Rev. Professor Curtis . . . . .	103
" Mr Emslie . . . . .	104
" Professor Mair . . . . .	104

## APPENDIX.

(a) Rules of the Association . . . . .	107
(b) List of Officials, 1904-5 . . . . .	109
(c) List of Members . . . . .	110



**MEETING HELD AT EDINBURGH,**  
**On SATURDAY, 26th NOVEMBER 1904.**

---

**T**HE FIFTH GENERAL MEETING of the ASSOCIATION was held in the Greek Class-Room, Edinburgh University, on Saturday, 26th November 1904, at 11 A.M., the President, Professor G. G. RAMSAY, LL.D., in the chair. More than fifty members of the association were present, and the Secretary intimated a number of apologies for absence.

The chief arrangements for this meeting in Edinburgh were made under the direction of a Local Committee, with Dr Heard, Headmaster of Fettes College, as Convener.

The Annual Reports of the Secretary and the Treasurer were read and adopted. The Secretary's Report showed an increase of 16 in the membership during the year 1903-4, bringing the total number of members of the association, at 31st October 1904, up to 209. The income of the association for the year, including balance carried forward from 1902-3, amounted to £88, 18s. 3d., and the expenditure was £46, 9s. 7d.; balance to be carried forward, £42, 8s. 8d. The accounts were examined by Messrs Maybin (Ayr Academy) and Smith (Merchiston Castle), and found to be correct.

It was agreed that the regular meetings of the association for 1905 should be held at Aberdeen on 11th March, and at Glasgow on 25th November.

The retiring members of the General Committee, Professor Burnet, Dr Marshall, Mr Stirling, and Mr Temple were re-elected for another year.

The following papers were read:—

“On the Pronunciation of Latin and Greek in Schools and Colleges,” by Professor W. R. HARDIE, Edinburgh.

“On the Literary Teaching of Ancient and Modern Languages,” by Professor G. SAINTSBURY, Edinburgh.

## PRESIDENT'S OPENING ADDRESS.

Professor RAMSAY, at the opening of the proceedings, said:— Having on the last two occasions of our opening meeting for the season absorbed more than my share of your time, I shall not address you at undue length to-day. We are to have read to us to-day two papers of great interest, which will invite, and I doubt not bring forth, discussion; and as it is the main object of our association to deal with practical problems, with a view to practicable reforms or improvements in our educational methods, it is essential for the success of our meeting that time be given for full discussion of all the papers read.

Yet a few words must be said upon the work done by our association during the past year; upon the notable fact that England, the ancient and secure home of classical learning and classical education, has paid Scotland the rare compliment of following her example in founding "a Classical Association for England and Wales," on lines almost identical with our own; and lastly, upon the policy which we, as classical men—that is to say, as men convinced that if the intellect of the nation is to be nurtured, as well as its material interests, it is essential that the classics shall continue to hold an important place in its higher education—the policy which we should now sketch out for ourselves in view of the flood of crude ideas upon the subject which has been let loose upon the popular mind.

The first public meeting of the English Classical Association at Oxford, upon 28th May 1904, was a great and successful gathering. The views which found favour there were entirely in harmony with the ideas which brought our own association into being. I had the honour of being asked to speak on the occasion. On behalf of the association, I presented our congratulations and

good wishes to the new society, and shortly explained the objects of our own; dwelling on the point that whilst we were anxious to do all that was possible to improve the methods of classical teaching in accordance with the requirements of the times, our main object was to impress upon the public mind the importance of right aims and right methods in the teaching of all subjects, whatever they might be; and to do what we could to save all that was best in the old educational curriculum from being swept away by false and unsubstantial methods of utility.

On the futility and absurdity of much that is seriously advocated nowadays in the name of useful and practical education I have already said much, but I should like to direct your attention to an incisive pamphlet lately published by an old student of my own, Professor Cappon, of Kingston, Ontario, in which he denounces Mr Seath, the Canadian minister of education for passing an Education Bill in which Latin is made henceforth optional in the training of public school teachers. Professor Cappon gives some exquisite instances of the progressive or "concrete" educational methods advocated by some up-to-date educationists in America. Some of these advanced persons tell us that the literary method of education is obsolete; it is much more important, they tell us, to cultivate the neglected sense of touch. In St Paul they have lately established a mechanics' arts high school on the express principle that "there is just as much intellectual discipline to be derived from sawing a board straight, or making a dove-tailed joint, as from translating a passage of Cicero or solving a problem of geometry." Even the superintendent of the school, Mr Weitbrecht, pronounces this view "somewhat one-sided and unpedagogical." The "concrete" method of education is advocated by Mr Charles Zueblin, Professor of Sociology in the University of Chicago. Here is how he describes the new methods used in the Washington High Schools:—"The beloved domestic dog is brought into the school-room. Could the evidence of the superiority of the new methods over the old be more vividly presented than in the contrast of a