

**TRADE UNIONS AND THE LAW IN
NEW YORK: A STUDY OF SOME
LEGAL PHASES OF LABOR
ORGANIZATIONS, PP. 5-133
[459-587]**

Published @ 2017 Trieste Publishing Pty Ltd

ISBN 9780649723058

Trade Unions and the Law in New York: A Study of Some Legal Phases of Labor Organizations,
pp. 5-133 [459-587] by George Gorham Groat

Except for use in any review, the reproduction or utilisation of this work in whole or in part in any form by any electronic, mechanical or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including xerography, photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, is forbidden without the permission of the publisher, Trieste Publishing Pty Ltd, PO Box 1576 Collingwood, Victoria 3066 Australia.

All rights reserved.

Edited by Trieste Publishing Pty Ltd.
Cover @ 2017

This book is sold subject to the condition that it shall not, by way of trade or otherwise, be lent, re-sold, hired out, or otherwise circulated without the publisher's prior consent in any form or binding or cover other than that in which it is published and without a similar condition including this condition being imposed on the subsequent purchaser.

www.triestepublishing.com

GEORGE GORHAM GROAT

**TRADE UNIONS AND THE LAW IN
NEW YORK: A STUDY OF SOME
LEGAL PHASES OF LABOR
ORGANIZATIONS,
PP. 5-133 [459-587]**

2618

TRADE UNIONS AND THE LAW IN NEW YORK

A STUDY OF SOME LEGAL PHASES OF LABOR
ORGANIZATIONS

BY

GEORGE GORHAM GROAT, A. M.

SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS
FOR THE DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY
IN THE
FACULTY OF POLITICAL SCIENCE,
COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY

Columbia University
1905

PREFACE

THE following pages form part of a study of labor organizations—a study which the writer expects to complete in the near future. The completed work will embrace an examination of trade unions viewed as a factor in the economic activity of New York state.

The portion here presented includes two parts. The first deals with efforts to secure legislation favorable to the interests of organized labor. It aims to describe the more important legislative activities of the state federation. The second part deals with the lawfulness of trade-union activities. It traces the development of the law and of those decisions of the courts that pertain to the legal status of labor unions.

The effort throughout has been to determine the controlling principles, economic or social, and to ascertain, as far as possible, to what extent these principles conform to the wider economic and social principles upon which the present industrial life depends.

In the parts of the work not yet ready for publication the non-legal phases will be taken up, and attention will be devoted to the practical activities of trade unions in their efforts to influence to their advantage economic activity.

The sources referred to are only such as furnish material at first hand, as the proceedings of the annual conventions of the State Workingmen's Assembly and of the State Workingmen's Federation; the constitutions

3218
G87

142641

of these organizations; the session laws of the state; the reports of the decisions of the courts; and the annual reports and the quarterly bulletins of the state department of labor. For convenience a table is appended stating the cases to which reference is made, and, furthermore, stating the time at which each decision was made and by what court. Much valuable information has also been secured through interviews with labor leaders and with others who are conversant with the practical side of the movement.

Finally, the writer takes this opportunity to acknowledge his debt of gratitude to the members of the faculty in Economics in the School of Political Science. The helpful suggestions, the kindly advice, and above all the guiding inspiration of these men have done much to enable the author to accomplish what is here presented.

G. G. G.

NEW YORK, *May*, 1905.

CONTENTS

	PAGE
TABLE OF CASES
PART I. LABOR ORGANIZATIONS AS A FACTOR IN LEGISLATION.	
CHAPTER I.	
NUMERICAL STRENGTH.	
Practical difficulties in estimating the numerical strength—Continual changes in the number	11
CHAPTER II.	
DEVELOPMENT OF THE STATE FEDERATION.	
Early Workingmen's Assembly—Its origin—Other state organizations—Union into the Federation—Constitution	16
CHAPTER III.	
THE STATE FEDERATION AT WORK.	
The annual convention—Efforts to seat and unseat legislators—The Legislative Committee—Results	23
CHAPTER IV.	
INDEPENDENT POLITICAL ACTION.	
A new movement—Differences of opinion—Duties of a legislator	40
PART II. LEGAL STATUS OF LABOR ORGANIZATIONS.	
CHAPTER V.	
THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE LAW OF CONSPIRACY.	
Early influences—Law in 1828—Revision of 1870—The Penal Code, 1881 Efforts of labor organizations	48

CHAPTER VI.

JUDICIAL DECISIONS—THE RIGHT TO STRIKE—BEFORE 1890.	
Early cases—Journeyman Cordwainers of New York, 1809—People v. Trequier, 1823—People v. Fisher, 1835—Master Stevedores' Association v. Walsh, 1867—Minor cases	58

CHAPTER VII.

JUDICIAL DECISIONS—THE RIGHT TO STRIKE—SINCE 1890.	
From conspiracy to injunction—Curran v. Galen, 1893-97—Davis v. United Engineers, 1898—National Protective Association v. Cumming, 1899-1902—Minor cases—Boycott and picket	72

CHAPTER VIII.

DEVELOPMENT OF LEGAL RIGHT TO ORGANIZE.	
Efforts to secure right to organize—Changes in the laws—Present status	89

CHAPTER IX.

JUDICIAL DECISIONS—LEGAL STATUS OF ORGANIZATION.	
Right to enforce by-laws—Right of discharged member to reinstatement—Right to act through delegate—Validity of trade agreement	93

CHAPTER X.

DISCUSSION OF CASES.	
Reasons for uncertainty of principles—Legal v. moral phases—Conspiracy—Use of force—Motives—Individual rights—Economic principles—Competition and monopoly	105

CHAPTER XI.

CONCLUSION	126
----------------------	-----

TABLE OF CASES

- Austin *v.* Dutcher. App. Div., 1900. 67 N. Y. Supp., 819.
 Beattie *v.* Callanan. App. Div., 1901. 67 App. Div., 14.
 Cohen *v.* United Garment Workers. Su. Ct., 1901. 35 Misc., 749.
 Coons *v.* Chrystie. Su. Ct., 1898. 24 Misc., 296.
 Cordwainers' Case, 1811. See 2 Wheeler's Cr. Cases, 262.
 Corregan *v.* Hay. App. Div., 1904. 94 App. Div., 71.
 Cummings *v.* Union Blue Stone Co. Ct. of Apps., 1900. 164 N. Y.,
 401.
 Curran *v.* Galen. Ct. of Apps., 1897. 152 N. Y., 33.
 Davenport *v.* Walker. App. Div., 1901. 57 App. Div., 223.
 Davis *v.* United Engineers. App. Div., 1898. 28 App. Div., 396.
 Davis *v.* Zimmerman. Su. Ct., 1895. 91 Hund., 489.
 Eden *v.* Silberberg. App. Div., 1903. 89 App. Div., 259.
 Foster *v.* Retail Clerks' Protective Association. Su. Ct., 1902. 39
 Misc., 48.
 Herzog and Erbe *v.* Fitzgerald. App. Div., 1902. 74 App. Div.,
 110.
 Jacobs *v.* Cohen *et al.* App. Div., 1904. 90 N. Y. Supp., 854.
 Johnston Harvesting Co. *v.* Meinhardt. Su. Ct., 1880. 24 Hun,
 489.
 Lafond *v.* Deems. Ct. of Apps., 1880. 81 N. Y., 507.
 Master Horseshoers' Protective Association *v.* Quinlivan. App.
 Div., 1903. 83 App. Div., 459.
 Master Stevedores' Association *v.* Walsh. Ct. of Com. Pleas, 1867.
 2 Daly, 1.
 McHenry *v.* Jewett. Ct. of Apps., 1882. 90 N. Y., 58.
 Mills *v.* U. S. Printing Co. App. Div., 1905. 99 App. Div., 605.
 National Protective Association *v.* Cumming. Ct. of Apps., 1902.
 170 N. Y., 315.
 People *v.* Barondess. Su. Ct., 1891. 41 N. Y. Rep., 659.
 People *v.* Fisher. Su. Ct. of Jud., 1835. 14 Wendell, 9.
 People *ex rel.* Gill *v.* Smith. Oyer and Term., 1887. 5 N. Y. Cr.
 Rep., 509.
 People *ex rel.* Gill *v.* Walsh. Ct. of Apps., 1888. 100 N. Y., 633.
 463]

- People *v.* Kostka. Oyer and Term., 1886. 4 N. Y. Cr. Rep., 429.
People *v.* Lenhardt. Gen. Ses. N. Y. Co., 1886. 4 N. Y. Cr. Rep., 317.
People *v.* McFarlin. Monroe Co., 1904. 43 Misc., 591.
People *ex rel.* O'Brien *v.* Van Wyck. Su. Ct., 1899. 27 Misc., 439.
People *v.* Powell. Ct. of Apps., 1875. 63 N. Y., 88.
People *v.* Sheldon. Ct. of Apps., 1893. 139 N. Y., 251.
People *v.* Trequier. N. Y. City Cr. Ct., 1823. 1 Wheeler Cr. Cases, 142.
People *v.* Wilzig. Oyer and Term., 1886. 4 N. Y. Cr. Rep., 403.
Potter *v.* Sheffer. Su. Ct., 1903. 81 N. Y. Supp., 164.
Reform Club of Masons and Plasterers *v.* Laborers' Union Protective Society. Su. Ct., 1899. 29 Misc., 247.
Reynolds *v.* Everett. Su. Ct., 1893. 22 N. Y. Supp., 306.
Rogers *v.* Everts. Su. Ct., 1891. 17 N. Y. Supp., 264.
Sinsheimer *v.* United Garment Workers. Su. Ct., 1894. 77 Hun, 215.
Sleicher *v.* Grogan. App. Div., 1899. 43 App. Div., 213.
Stone Cleaning and Pointing Union *v.* Russell. Su. Ct., 1902. 38 Misc., 513.
Sun Printing and Publishing Association *v.* Delaney. App. Div., 1900. 48 App. Div., 623.
Tallman *v.* Gaillard. Su. Ct., 1899. 27 Misc., 114.
Thomas *v.* Musical Mutual Protective Union. Su. Ct., 1888. 2 N. Y. Supp., 195.
Wood *v.* Whitehead Bros. Co. Ct. of Apps., 1901. 165 N. Y., 545.
Wunch *v.* Shankland. Ct. of Apps., 1902. 170 N. Y., 573. Also, 179 N. Y., Mem. 33. (1904).